

COMMITTEE REPORT

Committee: East Area **Ward:** Skelton, Rawcliffe, Clifton Without
Date: 28 September 2006 **Parish:** Clifton Without Parish Council

Reference: 06/01594/OUTM
Application at: Land Lying To The South Of Centurion Office Park Tribune Way York
For: Outline application for erection of 12 no. dwellings (Re-submission 06/00451/OUT)
By: Keyland Gregory Limited
Application Type: Major Outline Application (13 weeks)
Target Date: 11 October 2006

1.0 PROPOSAL

The application site is between the office developments on Tribune Way and the residential development accessed via Woodland Chase off Water Lane. The application seeks outline planning permission, including siting and means of access, for 12 dwellings. The site area is approximately 0.33ha which would equate to 36 dwellings per hectare. The site has a standard employment allocation which stipulates that the land should be developed for B1, B2, or B8 use.

2.0 POLICY CONTEXT

2.1 Development Plan Allocation:

City Boundary York City Boundary 0001

DC Area Teams East Area (2) 0005

2.2 Policies:

CYGP1
Design

CYE3B
Existing and Proposed Employment Sites

CYH2A
Affordable Housing

CYH5A
Residential Density

3.0 CONSULTATIONS

3.1 Internal

3.1.1 Highway Network Management - Residential layouts are designed to a road hierarchy in accordance with the CYC Residential Design Guide. Hornbeam Close, as a cul-de-sac spur off the main access route, was set out as an informal shared surface road. Such designs aim to provide a less formal layout in order to restrict vehicle speeds to well below 20mph. Elements of such designs to reduce vehicle speeds include tortuous layouts and variable surface widths.

National guidance has indicated that the use of tortuous routes and informal/shared surface layouts can directly influence driver behaviour and reduce vehicle speeds. Such layouts have been demonstrated to not increase the risk of accidents.

The cul-de-sac currently serves 12 dwellings. Guidance contained in the CYC Residential Design Guide advises that shared surface roads (such as Hornbeam Close) are capable of adequately serving up to 25 dwellings as a cul-de-sac. Therefore even with the proposed development the total number of dwellings served by the cul-de-sac does not exceed this advised level.

Based upon recognised national survey information the proposed dwellings would generate in the region of an additional 7 vehicle movements in the peak hours. It is officer view that the surrounding junctions and highway layout can accommodate the negligible increase in traffic without any detriment to either highway safety or the free flow of traffic.

Officers therefore consider that there are no technical/construction nor highway safety reasons why a formal objection should be raised.

3.1.2 Economic Development - The land should remain for employment purposes. The applicant has made little attempt to find innovative solutions to letting the units or undertaken a full investigation into alternative light industrial uses. Allowing residential development on this land may create a precedent and reduce employment land provision over time.

3.1.3 Conservation and Design - No objections. The site lies adjacent to a scheduled ancient monument and an archaeological watching brief condition should be included with any approval.

3.1.4 City Development - Policy H2a sets a target of 50% affordable housing on sites of 0.3ha and over in urban areas. The application site is above this threshold and therefore affordable housing should be provided. Policy H5a requires residential developments to achieve minimum net residential densities, subject to the character of the surrounding area and local amenity considerations. The proposed density of approximately 35 dwellings per hectare (dph) meets the minimum requirement set out in PPG3, but falls short of the 40 dph for urban areas recommended in policy H5a. However, given the need to meet minimum separation distances to site

boundaries and adjacent residential dwellings, the density as proposed may be considered appropriate.

3.2 External

3.2.1 Clifton Without Parish Council - Object to the application because the site is designated for employment and light industry.

3.2.2 Clifton Moor Business Association - No comments at the time of writing the report.

3.2.3 Yorkshire Water - No objections, various conditions were suggested to be included with any approval.

3.2.4 Response to neighbour consultation letters and site notice posted 09/08/06 - 24 objections received and one petition signed by 97 local residents. The following points were raised in the objection letters:

- a) additional traffic in a quiet cul-de-sac making it unsafe, particularly for children (x19)
- b) Hornbeam Close is not wide enough for two way traffic (x13)
- c) The development may create a 'rat run' for cars trying to avoid the Clifton Moor Gate / Water Lane traffic lights (x8)
- d) Hornbeam Close is unsuitable to be used by construction lorries (x2)
- e) infringe on current privacy levels (x2)
- f) drainage and sewerage problems (x10)
- g) general inconvenience / nuisance (x3)
- h) noise (x4)
- i) disruption (x3)
- j) opens Hornbeam Close up to potential acts of vandalism and crime (x4)
- k) affect the market value of current houses (x4)

4.0 APPRAISAL

4.1 Key Issue(s):

- Loss of Standard Employment Site
- Residential Density
- Affordable Housing
- Highways

4.2 The Application Site - An application was submitted and later withdrawn earlier in 2006 for residential development at the application site plus light industrial developments. At this time access to the residential development was to be via Tribune Way off Clifton Moor Gate. The applicant purchased extra land to the south of the proposed residential development which has now provided the land owners with the opportunity to apply for access to the proposed new dwellings through Hornbeam Close. The application site is allocated as a standard employment site

where B1 (Business), B2 (General Industrial), and B8 (Storage or Distribution) uses are desired.

Loss of Standard Employment Site

4.3 Draft Local Plan Policy E3b states that standard employment sites (such as Centurion Park) will be retained within their current use class. Planning permission for other uses will only be given where: a) there is a sufficient supply of employment land to meet both medium and longer term requirements in both qualitative and quantitative terms; AND conforms with ONE of the following criteria: b) unacceptable environmental problems exist; or c) the development of the site for other appropriate uses will lead to significant benefits to the local economy; or d) the use is ancillary to an employment use.

4.4 The application for outline permission to erect 12 dwellings must conform with part a) and one of parts b) to d) in policy E3b as outlined above. Parts b) and d) do not appear to be of relevance for this application as environmental problems are not evident and residential development is not considered ancillary to the existing employment site. The applicant has failed to demonstrate how the proposal satisfies sections a) and c). First considering section a), the applicant has failed to supply robust evidence which justifies the loss of employment land for present and future B1, B2, and B8 use. An Economic Development Officer looked into the application and concluded that there has been little attempt to find innovative solutions to letting the current redundant office/light industrial units on the site. Whilst the application site is relatively small in relation to the entire site it could set a precedent for further reduction in employment land provision over time. Due to the constraints placed on the availability of greenfield development sites around York by the existing Green Belt, it is particularly important to ensure that land currently designated for employment uses are safeguarded for their identified land-uses. It has also not been demonstrated how the 12 new dwellings would provide significant benefits to the local economy, therefore the proposal does not satisfy section c).

Residential Density

4.5 Draft Local Plan Policy CYGP1 states that development proposals will be expected to be of a density that is compatible with neighbouring buildings, spaces and the character of the area.

4.6 Draft Local Plan Policy H5a states that proposed residential developments should be compatible with the character of the surrounding area. Applications for all new residential developments should aim to achieve net residential densities of 40 dwellings per hectare in the urban area.

4.7 The proposed development is for 12 dwellings on approximately 0.33ha, this equates to approximately 36 dph. This is within the 30 - 50 dph as recommended in Planning Policy Guidance 3: Housing. The Local Plan aims to achieve 40 dph in the urban area. However, given the physical separation which would be required between the proposed dwellings and previous residential and commercial developments in the area the proposed density is considered acceptable. The density of the existing housing development south of the application site is of a similar density to that proposed.

Affordable Housing Provision

4.8 Draft Local Plan Policy H2a states that proposals for all new housing development with a site area of 0.3Ha or more in the urban area will be required to provide affordable housing provision. The target level is 50%, consisting of 45% affordable rent and 5% for discounted sale.

4.9 There is a continued need for the development of affordable housing within York. The Housing Need Survey shows that there is both the demand and need for affordable housing in order to meet current and future accommodation needs. The applicant claims the size of the site is below 0.3ha however it has been measured electronically by the council as being approximately 0.33ha. Therefore the affordable housing condition applies and 6 of the proposed 12 dwellings should be affordable. The applicant has not indicated a willingness to provide affordable housing nor has there been an attempt to justify in terms of financial viability of the scheme as to why affordable housing cannot be accommodated on the site.

Highway Issues

4.10 There were a large number of neighbour objections concerning the suitability of Hornbeam Close as an access road for 12 new dwellings. Highway Network Management looked into the proposal and could not find any strong reason for refusing this application. It has been suggested that the cul-de-sac is capable of supporting 25 dwellings. The structure and design of the road act as a barrier to travelling at speed along Hornbeam Close.

Local Resident Concerns

4.11 The main neighbouring concerns were listed in section 3.2.4 of this report and are labelled a) to k). These concerns are briefly addressed below:

- a) + b) These concerns are primarily addressed above (4.10). Hornbeam Close has a shared surface which is used by both pedestrians and vehicles. Whilst the residential developments would increase vehicle numbers in the area it is considered that they could be accommodated safely as part of the existing housing development.
- c) No through route to connect the new housing development to Tribune Way is proposed.
- d) This application is outline only and this is not a material consideration at this point.
- e) This would be considered on a reserved matters application and cannot be fully assessed at outline stage.
- f) This comes under the remit of Building Control and is not a material planning consideration.
- g) + h) +i) Some general inconvenience and disruption is inevitable with all building work. Nuisance could be controlled by planning conditions as part of any reserved matters approval.
- j) It is not clear how a new residential development would open up the area to further crime. Any reserved matters application can be considered within the 'Designing Out Crime' initiative.
- k) This is not a planning consideration.

5.0 CONCLUSION

The proposed residential dwellings would result in the loss of employment land. This site has been designated as such to accommodate present and future employment need.

The site is above 0.3ha and therefore 50% affordable housing should be provided on the site, the applicant has not expressed a willingness to provide this.

COMMITTEE TO VISIT

6.0 RECOMMENDATION: Refuse

- 1 The application site lies within an area which is designated as a standard employment site. It is considered that it has not been proven that there is a sufficient supply of employment land to meet immediate and longer term requirements or that the proposed change of use would lead to significant benefits to the local economy. Therefore the proposal is considered contrary to Policy E3b of the City of York Draft Local Plan.
- 2 The proposal does not provide for the affordable housing needs of the community, as described in policy H2a of the City of York Draft Local Plan, incorporating the 4th set of changes and as supported in Planning Policy Guidance 3: Housing.

7.0 INFORMATIVES:

Contact details:

Author: Michael Jones Development Control Officer
Tel No: 01904 551325